

Status of the PR&PP Methodology

Robert Bari Co-chair, PR&PP Working Group

PR&PP Workshop 22 February, 2011 Tokyo, Japan



GIF Goals for PR&PP

The Technology Goals for Generation IV highlight PR&PP as one of the four goal areas along with Sustainability, Safety and Reliability, and Economics:

Generation IV nuclear energy systems will increase the assurance that they are a very unattractive and the least desirable route for diversion or theft of weapons-usable materials, and provide increased physical protection against acts of terrorism.



PR&PP Working Group: Terms of Reference

- Advise the PG and EG on PR&PP issues related to Gen IV nuclear energy systems
- Maintain capability to perform or direct PR&PP studies on request of GIF
- **Monitor** the integrity and quality of PR&PP evaluations for GIF (peer review on request)
- <u>Maintain configuration control</u> over the PR&PP methodology, its documentation and revisions
- Strengthen the link with GenIV system designers, in particular with GIF SSCs
- <u>Promote and facilitate</u> early consideration of PR&PP in the development and design of GenIV systems
- Maintain cognizance of related GIF activities, e.g., safety, economics
- <u>Maintain cognizance</u> of and interactions with non-GIF activities such as IAEA initiatives and specific national initiatives
- **<u>Promote</u>** PR&PP goals and broad acceptance of the PR&PP methodology



Chronology of Activities

- December 2002: First Meeting of PR&PP WG
- 2003-2006: Development of Methodology <u>Rev. 5</u> www.gen-4.org/Technology/horizontal/PRPPEM.pdf
- <u>Rev. 6</u> of Methodology (final draft completed late 2010):
 - o user guidance
 - expert elicitation process
 - Metric selection
- Workshops with users and stakeholders: 2004 (USA), 2006 (Italy), 2006 (Japan), 2008 (South Korea), <u>2011 (Japan)</u>
- 21st meeting of PR&PP WG in <u>Tokai, February 23-24, 2011</u>



Chronology of Activities (cont'd)

- Presentations to peer community at major technical conferences: e.g. Global; PSAM; ESARDA, IAEA, ANS, INMM, etc.
- 2003-2010: Sub-group assignments of specialized topics
- 2003-2009: Example Sodium Fast Reactor (ESFR) Studies
- 2007: Initiated interactions with GIF System Steering Committees

 Joint report with SSCs near completion
- 2008: Initiated "Harmonization" activity with IAEA/INPRO
- 2011: Special Issue of ANS Journal on PR&PP Work



PR&PP Methodology



Methodology Report: http://www.gen-4.org/Technology/horizontal/PRPPEM.pdf



Measures

Physical Protection

Proliferation Resistance

- Adversary Success Probability
- Consequence
- Cost of Protection

- Technical Difficulty
- Detection Probability
- Material Type
- Proliferation Cost
- Proliferation Time
- Safeguards Cost



Major Applications

- Case Study (completed; EG review by 2010 April 30)
 - Assessment of entire fuel-cycle for the Example Sodium Fast Reactor (ESFR)
 - Sub-groups analyzing different types of PR&PP threats
 - *Purpose is to advance the methodology*

http://www.gen-4.org/Technology/horizontal/proliferation.htm

- Engagement with GIF SSCs (in progress)
 - Began in mid 2007: introduce PR&PP into the six GIF designs
 - <u>Purpose</u>: Generate insights concerning design and operating features to enhance PR&PP performance of Gen IV systems
 - <u>Longer Term</u>: Establish beneficial PR&PP-related design and operation principles and practices
 - Three workshops (May 2008, July 2009, January 2010), attended by SSC representatives and industry observers
 - Products include PR&PP white papers for each system, developed jointly by SSCs and PR&PP WG members
 - Compendium report for public release (mid 2011), including chapter on crosscutting issues (e.g. fuel cycle issues)



Knowledge Gaps

- Scenario Completeness
 - Need to explore more fully
 - Threats are stylized
- Human Performance
- Rolling up elements of an evaluation
- Harmonizing Design Understanding with Potential Safeguards/Protection Possibilities
- Conveying and Displaying Results: In particular, what we know about what we do not know



Final Note

It is the insights gained from the disciplined process of performing evaluations that are of value, and not just the final results.

Seek benefits of PR&PP evaluations early in the design process, and revisit throughout.